Childhood Circumstances: Consumption Poverty: Measurement Matters

David Johnson
University of Michigan

FESAC
June 14, 2019
What is Poverty?
“We define poverty as economic deprivation. A way of expressing this concept is that it pertains to people’s lack of economic resources (e.g., money or near money income) for consumption of economic goods and services (e.g., food, housing, clothing, transportation). Thus, a poverty standard is based on a level of family resources (or, alternatively, of families’ actual consumption) deemed necessary to obtain a minimally adequate standard of living, defined appropriately for the United States today.”
History of SPM

National Academy of Sciences convenes a panel of experts to conduct a study of statistical issues in the measurement and understanding of poverty, June 1992.

1990


2000

An Interagency Technical Working Group on Developing a Supplemental Poverty Measure is formed by Commerce Under Secretary Rebecca Blank and Office of Management and Budget Chief Statistician Katherine Wallman and charged with developing a set of initial starting points to permit the U.S. Census Bureau, in cooperation with the Bureau of Labor Statistics, to produce a Supplemental Measure, December 2009.

2010
Key feature of SPM: resources and thresholds are consistent and balanced.
Advantages of SPM

- Resources and Thresholds are consistent
- Thresholds annually updated by changing standard of living
- Resources include all government transfers (net of taxes), and can demonstrate impact of transfers on poverty
- Allows for geographic differences in housing costs
- Attempts to deal with differences in health care and differences between owners and renters
Change in Number of People in Poverty
After Including Each Element: 2017

What one thinks of the contrasting ways in which consumption and income resource definitions treat people who are income-rich but consumption-poor and people who are in the reverse situation depends on one's view of the meaning and purpose of a poverty measure. One view is that the poverty measure should reflect the actual level of material well-being or consumption in the society (in terms of the number of people above the threshold), regardless of how that well-being is attained. Another view is that the poverty measure should reflect people's ability to obtain a level of material well-being above the threshold through the use of their own income and related resources.
On the fundamental question of whether to base the definition of family resources for the poverty measure on income or consumption, we believe that there are merits to the conceptual arguments on both sides of the debate. On balance, many members of the panel find more compelling the arguments in favor of a consumption definition that attempts to assess actual levels of material well-being. However, in the United States today, adequate data with which to implement a consumption-based resource definition for use in the official poverty measure are not available.
Conceptual reason for Consumption
Life-Cycle Permanent Income Hypothesis

Time/Age

Annual income

Consumption
Example 1: Traditional model

Respond by smoothing income shocks
However, consumption responds to income shocks, especially at low end.
Some may use extra debt to over-consume.
Example 3: Under-reported Income

Measurement Reason for consumption: Reported income may be under-reported
Consumption is related to income (.6) 80% lie between Consumption-to-income ratios (APC) of .5 and 2
Measurement Matters

- Quality of CE data
- Sample size in CE support state-level estimates (currently MSA level)
- How to obtain annual consumption from quarterly CE spending data
- What do we include in consumption
  - Housing, Health, Education
  - Measuring service flows for housing and durables
- What about under-reporting of spending (e.g., alcohol, clothing)?
- What do we do about elderly?
- How can we examine the impacts of government programs?
- How do we determine a consistent thresholds?
Measurement Issue: Under-reporting of consumption and income is stable

Ratio: Survey total to NIPA

CE/PCE see https://www.bls.gov/cex/cepceconcordance.htm
CPS/PI see https://www.census.gov/content/dam/Census/library/working-papers/2015/demo/SEHSD-WP2015-01.pdf
Quarterly consumption is more disperse than annual yielding higher poverty rate.
SNAP effects on Income vs. Consumption
30% of SNAP participants are Extramarginal, $B_1^*$
Trends in Income (SPM) and Consumption Poverty (Meyer/Sullivan) are similar (Pov=1 in 1980)

NOTE: All use thresholds adjusted by CPI-U-RS
Use SPM thresholds for both: Trends in Income (SPM) and Consumption Poor (2005-2015; PSID)
Measurement Issue: Are the income poor and consumption poor the same people (2015; PSID)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Not Consumption poor</th>
<th>Consumption poor</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Not SPM poor</td>
<td>73.8%</td>
<td>14.8%</td>
<td>88.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPM poor</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td>11.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>80.2%</td>
<td>19.8%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What should we do?

- Need Consumption poverty measure to complement SPM
- But we also need to consider wealth
  - need all three – I, C & W
- Consider a consumption poverty using the SPM thresholds
- We need to be careful with the index to update thresholds
  - don’t only update with inflation.
  - Updates to Statistical Policy Directive 14
- More research into what to include in consumption
  - Housing, Health, Education
- Research on under-reporting of Income and Consumption
  - (CID and CED)
- Use Census funding for a CNSTAT consensus panel
For the years 1959-1968 the statistics on poverty contained in the Census Bureau's Current Population Reports, Series P-60, No. 68, shall be used.

For the years 1969 and thereafter, the statistics contained in subsequent applicable reports in this series shall be used. The Bureau of the Census series continues the Social Security Administration definition for the base year, 1963.

Annual adjustments in Census series are based on changes in the average annual total Consumer Price Index (CPI) instead of changes in the cost of the U.S. Department of Agriculture's Economy Food Plan.

Other measures of poverty may be developed for particular research purposes, and published, so long as they are clearly distinguished from the standard data series.
The FY2020 budget request includes the following program changes: Supplemental Poverty Measure (+$2,000,000).

The Census Bureau will fund a research study by the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine to evaluate and improve the supplemental poverty measure.
Final Thought: Obtain P & Q, Y & C from survey, admin and commercial data.